

Freedom of Information Act 2000 (FOIA)

Decision notice

Date: 30 April 2025

Public Authority: British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC)
Address: BBC Broadcasting House
Portland Place
London
W1A 1AA

Decision (including any steps ordered)

1. The complainant requested information from the BBC about the production of the documentary "Gaza: How to Survive a War Zone". The BBC responded that the requested information was covered by the derogation and hence excluded from FOIA.
2. The Commissioner's decision is that this information, if held at all, is held by the BBC for the purposes of journalism, art or literature and so is not covered by FOIA. He therefore upholds the BBC's position and requires no steps to be taken in this case.

Request and response

3. On 25 February 2025, the complainant wrote to the public authority and requested information in the following terms:

"Under the Freedom of Information Act 2000, I am requesting the disclosure of all records and documents relating to:

1. The costs of the production of the documentary, Gaza: How To Survive A War Zone, by HOYO Films, as broadcast on Monday 17th February 2025, now removed from BBC iPlayer; and
2. The BBC Commissioning Specification related to the same documentary, Gaza: How To Survive A War Zone, by HOYO Films, and
3. Any further notes / paperwork around compliance generated

thereto.

1. Costs

Please disclose any and all budgets, paperwork, emails and documents (including any final cost report) as submitted by HOYO Films to BBC on the costs (budgeted or otherwise) of the documentary. Any final cost report should include detail on the Actuals, Accruals, Total Spend, Estimated Final Costs and any Variances (over / under) on a line-by-line basis.

2. Commissioning Specification

Please disclose the BBC Commissioning Specification as filled out by HOYO Films and approved by BBC (signed by both parties) that forms part of the signed Programme Production Agreement for the documentary, Gaza: How To Survive A War Zone.

In particular, please disclose the sections entitled "Editorial Compliance Considerations":

Potential editorial issues relating to compliance with the BBC Editorial Guidelines that either will or may foreseeably arise in connection with the Programme, and how these will be addressed, following discussions between the Producer and the BBC Editorial Representative; and "Working With Children", including detail at:

(a) Please confirm the name of the company officer responsible for the welfare of any children present or otherwise involved with this Programme

(b) Please confirm that all Production Personnel who will come into contact with the children/young people are or will be familiar with the BBC's Child Protection Policy and with the BBC Editorial Guidelines Section 9: Children and Young People as Contributors

(c): If Either during the editorial compliance discussions outlined above it is agreed to hold a separate compliance meeting; and/or - during the course of production, activities affecting compliance occur and were unknown at the time of the earlier compliance discussion(s), the Producer will raise these with the BBC Executive Producer any actions or measures agreed to be taken shall form part of this Agreement.

3. Compliance Discussions

If there were any separate compliance discussions / meetings that took place pursuant to the obligations under the Programme Production Agreement / Commissioning Specification as set out above, including

meetings on compliance that were scheduled during the filming of the documentary, please disclose:

- (i) the date of such meetings; and
- (ii) any meeting notes, paperwork recorded or drafted during and / or following such meetings; and,
- (iii) emails or other correspondence (including via video call, on mobile phones or social media) on compliance issues that were discussed by BBC and HOYO Films at, or following the dates of such compliance meetings.

This request is made under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 (FOIA). While the BBC is exempt from disclosing information held for the purposes of journalism, art, or literature, it is not exempt from disclosing financial, governance, compliance, and legal risk-related information."

4. On 6 March 2025, the BBC responded to the request. The BBC explained that it believed that the information would be held for the purposes of "art, journalism or literature" and would therefore not be caught by FOIA. As a result, the BBC did not consider it was obliged to provide the information.

Reasons for decision

5. The following analysis covers whether the information requested is excluded from FOIA because it was held for the purposes of "journalism, art or literature".
6. FOIA only applies to the BBC to a limited extent. Schedule One, Part VI of FOIA provides that the BBC is a public authority for the purposes of FOIA, but it only has to deal with requests for information in some circumstances. The entry relating to the BBC states:

"The British Broadcasting Corporation, in respect of information held for purposes other than those of journalism, art or literature."
7. This is known as the "derogation". This means that information that the BBC holds for the purposes of journalism, art or literature - in broad terms, its output or related to its output - is not covered by FOIA. If information falls within the derogation, then that is the end of the matter; there is no public interest test or similar provision to consider the merits of disclosure.
8. Although it is publicly funded through the licence fee, the BBC competes with other commercial broadcasters who are not subject to FOIA.

Releasing information about its output, or related to its output, could therefore commercially disadvantage the BBC. However, for the derogation to apply, the BBC does not need to demonstrate that it would suffer commercial harm if the information were to be disclosed. It only has to demonstrate that the information is held for a derogated purpose.

9. Broadly, BBC information that is covered by FOIA includes information about: how the BBC is managed and run, including the TV licence; the BBC's employees and its human resources practices; and the BBC's performance.
10. BBC information that is not covered by FOIA includes the following: information about the BBC's on-screen or on-air "talent" including its presenters and journalists; information about BBC programmes including any spend or editorial decisions associated with its programming; materials that support the BBC's output, such as the script of a television programme or a source drawn on for an investigation; and viewer and listener complaints to the BBC about the above.
11. The derogation as it applies to the BBC is discussed in more detail in numerous published decisions made by the Commissioner, such that he does not consider it necessary to reproduce that detail again here. However, key to the derogation is the Supreme Court decision in *Sugar (Deceased) v British Broadcasting Corporation and another* [2012] UKSC 4¹
12. The Supreme Court explained that "journalism" primarily means the BBC's "output on news and current affairs", including sport, and that "journalism, art or literature" covers the whole of the BBC's output to the public (Lord Walker at paragraph 70). Therefore, in order for the information to be derogated and so fall outside FOIA, there should be a sufficiently direct link between the purpose(s) for which the information is held and the production of the BBC's output or the BBC's journalistic or creative activities involved in producing such output.
13. The Commissioner adopts a similar definition for the other elements of the derogation, in that the information must be used in the production, editorial management and maintenance of standards of those art forms.

¹ <https://www.supremecourt.uk/cases/docs/uksc-2010-0145-judgment.pdf>

The complainant's view

14. The complainant argued that the information ought to be disclosed because:

"...the information I have requested is in connection with specific BBC financial, governance, and compliance information that does not fall under this exemption; nor would it have a chilling effect on journalism or expose the BBC to commercial disadvantage with its competitors. Further, the information that I have requested should be disclosed in the public interest - releasing the information would be significantly beneficial to the public in order to assess whether the BBC has breached the Ofcom Broadcasting Code, its own Editorial Guidelines in connection with its contractual obligations under the Royal Charter, and crucially, anti-terrorism legislation".

15. As explained above, information about production costs, commissioning arrangements, and compliance discussions related to the BBC's output, if held, is derogated information. This type of information would be associated with the BBC's output because the requested information concerns the commissioning and production of the documentary named in the request.
16. The Commissioner is satisfied, based on the very well established precedent set in the numerous other decisions he has made in cases involving the BBC, that, if held at all, the information requested by the complainant would be held for the purposes of journalism, art or literature. It is therefore not covered by FOIA, and the BBC is not obliged to provide it.
17. The Commissioner finding is, therefore, that the BBC was not obliged to comply with the complainant's information request.

Right of appeal

18. Either party has the right to appeal against this decision notice to the First-tier Tribunal (Information Rights). Information about the appeals process may be obtained from:

First-tier Tribunal (Information Rights)
GRC & GRP Tribunals,
PO Box 9300,
LEICESTER,
LE1 8DJ

Tel: 0203 936 8963

Fax: 0870 739 5836

Email: grc@justice.gov.uk

Website: www.justice.gov.uk/tribunals/general-regulatory-chamber

19. If you wish to appeal against a decision notice, you can obtain information on how to appeal along with the relevant forms from the Information Tribunal website.
20. Any Notice of Appeal should be served on the Tribunal within 28 (calendar) days of the date on which this decision notice is sent.

Keeley Christine
Senior Case Officer
Information Commissioner's Office
Wycliffe House
Water Lane
Wilmslow
Cheshire
SK9 5AF